



OJAI VALLEY MUNICIPAL ADVISORY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING NOTICE AND AGENDA

FINAL MEETING MINUTES

**18 Valley Road, Oak View
Monday, May 16, 2022 – 7:00 PM**

Chair: Chris Cohen, **Vice Chair:** Joseph Westbury
Council Members: Barbara Kennedy, Grace Malloy, Terry Wright

REGARDING PUBLIC COMMENTS PRIOR TO THE MEETING:

IF YOU WISH TO MAKE EITHER A GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT OR COMMENT ON A SPECIFIC AGENDA ITEM BEING HEARD, YOU CAN SUBMIT YOUR COMMENT VIA EMAIL BY 4:00 PM THE DAY OF THE MEETING TO THE FOLLOWING ADDRESS: OVMAC@VENTURA.ORG OR CALL (805) 654-2703. PLEASE INCLUDE THE FOLLOWING INFORMATION IN YOUR EMAIL: (A) MEETING DATE, (B) AGENDA ITEM NUMBER, (C) SUBJECT OR TITLE OF THE ITEM, (D) YOUR FULL NAME. DURING PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE AGENDA ITEM SPECIFIED IN YOUR EMAIL, YOUR COMMENT WILL BE SUBMITTED FOR THE RECORD.

1. Call to Order of the Meeting

The meeting was called to order at 7:02 PM

2. Flag Salute

3. Roll Call - All members present minus Joe Westbury

4. Adoption of the Agenda

No Comments on the Agenda. Moved by **Chair Cohen**, Seconded by **Member Malloy**.
Approved unanimously.

5. Public Comments by Citizens on Matters Not Appearing on the Agenda

John Brooks - It's a joy to see so many people and had an email to send and was asked to speak to comment on the agenda. Dangerous sidewalk from Oak View Ave to the parking lot by the Goodwill store. The sidewalk needs to be repaired/replaced. Maruja got them to remove the rebar; there is a safety issue with pooling and dirt/cobble, please remove the obstruction and regrade the pathway, and get rid of the trash. Caltrans completed a much larger sidewalk along Miramonte on the eastside; why is Oak View not treated the same way? I'd like to know - can we fundraise to do it if Caltrans can't do it? I can get \$10,000 probably by tomorrow to do that project if they let us do it. I know it's in the project in 2026 but let the community do it. Please put this on a future agenda for more work on this area. Thank you to Dave Ward for his work on the southern California wastewater environmental impact report.

Ron Solorzano – Regional librarian for the Ojai Valley; please be aware that as of yesterday the Summer Reading Program has begun - geared towards youth and parents can take part. Young ones can track the minutes; adults can track their books, and you can enter giveaways. Looking to

have our in-person reading times for kids. Please contact Sharon at the Oak View Library or me at the Ojai Library.

Jeffrey Starkweather – Meiners Oaks resident and Nordhoff alumni; something for a future agenda item or for Matt's office to look into; Discussion regarding building a swimming pool at NHS and debating on the size of it; Need to make it for the whole community, not just for the high school; School may get together with the Ojai City rec department; More than half of the kids live in the unincorporated community and it seems that the County should also be at the table regarding these discussions and ability to have this used by all people; please encourage all county rec to get involved.

6. City of Ojai Planning Commission Update

Jamie Bennett – PC with the City of Ojai - Just joined about 6 months ago; reporting this first time; have been very busy this month and a half - you may have heard about the school district is trying to figure out how to dispose of chaparral auditorium and some historic school building; gave an update on the El Roblar Hotel. PC will vote on a proposal that is brought before them and can be approved or denied and can be appealed to the City Council. It was sent to the historic preservation commission and approved with a certain façade, passed 4-1 majority. El Roblar went to City Council on Appeal.

City Council had been approached by several people to lobby for the sale of cannabis from Bryant Circle to Ojai Ave. at the east end of town, CC deferred it to the PC. Took testimony, ultimately, met and there were several things were that in the proposal; 1. sale of seedling plants at the three existing cannabis retailers, but they cannot sell fresh plants. 2. request is that they have on-site lounges for consumption. Except we have a No Smoking Ordinance; and the two ordinances would conflict, but they could eat edibles and that was the recommendation to them. However, did not allow the expansion of the number of venues from 3 and did not approve moving to the main part of town.

A lot of new restaurants in Ojai now... now we have 7 new restaurants that are built and operating or are approved and will be operating in the next 18 months.

7. Approval of the Meeting Minutes of April 18, 2022

Motioned: Member Wright

Seconded: Member Kennedy

Upon call of the roll the vote was as follows:

Ayes: Members Kennedy, Member Malloy, Member Wright

Noes: 0

Abstain: Chair Cohen

Motion Carries: 3 – 0

Formal Items:

8. Review of a Modification to Conditional Use Permit for Camp Ramah (Case No. PL18-0052)

The applicant, Camp Ramah in California, requests the continued operation and maintenance of a camp for a 20-year term through a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) modification. The expansion of the CUP permit boundary, and construction of accessory structures that total 15,887 sq. ft. is also proposed. The project site is addressed at 385 Fairview Road, in the community of Ojai. The

nearest cross streets are Camp Ramah Road and Fairview Road. The subject property is comprised of approximately 431.45 acres. The Camp Ramah CUP boundary encompasses 83.45 acres. The property is zoned Rural and Open Space, with a land use designation of Rural Institutional and Open Space.

Staff Presentation - Planning Staff (Jennifer Trunk) presented the attached PowerPoint and informed meeting participants that there are mailing lists to the back of the room for all parties should they be outside of the mandated 300 feet radius notice. There are four mitigation measures, the current CUP and operation does not have an expiration date. Received a letter from the water purveyor based on the project and the district indicated that they should not exceed the water allocation. Cozy Dell and Foothill Trail will not be affected by the project and will remain as a public trail. The comment period for the MND ends May 25, 2022. The OVMAC reviewed the project in December 2019 and provided recommended conditions of approval.

Member Malloy - How is it that the additional beds would not increase the number of campers?

Planning Staff - They have a number of estimated campers for the summer included in the permit, between 600-700. They are simply spreading them out, breaking out the boys by age group.

Member Malloy - Is there anyone overseeing the number of campers, is there a way for the neighbors to check-in? That's a bit of a difference in traffic.

Planning Staff – The original special use permit did not indicate a head count for both staff and campers, this permit provides that detail. The camp may keep records of enrollment that could be requested.

Member Malloy – Why add those two very large open space parcels to the CUP if there is nothing changing in those spaces?

Planning Staff – I will defer that to Steve Welton of the applicant team.

Chair Cohen – Could you explain the change from 2019 to now, how the prior understanding that the special events ordinance would have applied and now doesn't?

Planning Staff – The special events ordinance was adopted within that time and only applies to specific zones. Does not apply to this zone, any events that would occur would be on the existing CUP.

Member Kennedy - Existing Ezra Café, what are the hours now?

Planning Staff – It's run by staff for staff not campers. Closes at 11 pm and is near the dining commons, like a coffee shop.

Applicant Presentation – Steve Welton Agent

Steve Welton - The project hasn't changed since we were last here in 2019. The primary goal of this application is to provide an interior functional space for the camps existing leadership program. The secondary goal is to provide a reception and drop-off area to improve the flow for check-in and reduce the circulation of buses, etc. We are prepared to accept mitigation measures recommended in the MND and the conditions from the MAC received in 2019, such as noise blankets. Had noise study done in 2020 and is going to include an automatic sound system. This system would automatically limit the amount of power going into the speakers, therefore the

volume of those speakers would not exceed the thresholds provided by the county. The CUP that is in effect would be fallen back on if denied and we hope this one would be approved with the proposed CUP which provides significant mitigation measures and enforceable parameters. We prefer to work with everyone to find solutions.

Introduced Board Chair Ellen Brown, Executive Director Rabbi Joe, CEO Randy Michaels, Board Member Lisa, staffer Jason, Maria Brewer Director of Operations, Jane Carroll, Project Architect, Jackline, Counsel for camp. Not present but available for questions, Jonathon Leech, acoustic consultant and is available on stand-by.

The parcels are owned by the camp currently, want to add them to the camp because they do use them for activities and recreation. Café Ezra is open one night a week during summer camp until 11 pm, with café level music, 45 dba is the maximum allowed for that time, which is about the noise level of a refrigerator.

Applicant Team (Rabbi Joe) - Thank you for welcoming us back, and happy to have this conversation. What is Camp Rama is a Jewish Non-Profit Summer Camp. Was originally on Foothill Drive in 1955 and is now on Fairview. As a non-profit camp, only serve non-profit organizations, in Jewish and non-Jewish communities. Most non-Jewish organizations are from Ventura County and do host a few private affairs, weddings, and bar-mitzvahs during the year. Our campers are 8 – 16 yrs. old, primarily from the west coast. We were able to operate last summer, as all of us have been able to return to life, which really reinforced the significance of these types of events for kids. Some of our neighbors we know by face and by name, and from my faith traditions, a lot of what makes our faith is based on listening. We will offer that to this foundation to listen and enhance our partnership with our neighbors. Café Ezra is a vocational educational program run by kids with special needs. That's the Thursday night activity that is happening until 11 pm. In terms of adding beds, we can show with our record and within our legal limit, that with more indoor programming we would have more room to do this type of program for 16 years as their final camping year. We have an occupancy limit, and this won't carry us over that limit at all.

Applicant Team (Steve Welton) - mentioned that the Ohan locates on one of those parcels, so it is on the open space parcel.

Chair Cohen – the report mentions a few places and the work you are doing with the Ojai Valley Land Conservancy (OVLC), an easement to the trail, and other conservation measures.

Applicant Team (Camp Ramah staff/board member) – we tried to work with OVLC to deed part of the parcel, but there is an existing forest service easement so the OVLC couldn't take that easement on top of another easement, we couldn't do it legally, but the trails are still open. The open space is being protected by the camp because there are no plans to build anything there. But if the camp was able make the agreement with the OVLC, the camp would be open to that and it was intended to be part of the CUP, but we ran into legal concerns.

Member Malloy – About how long is a Will Serve Letter good for with water? This one was issued in 2016.

Planning Staff - Water Serve letter is required before you get a building permit. The applicant team has been given updated letters as needed, the latest being 2020 or 2021.

Member Malloy - As part of the CUP are there any requirements for landscaping to be native and greywater usage.

Planning Staff – In regard to landscaping the State adopted the Model Efficient Landscape Ordinance (MELO). It's driven by a water budget and have to plant by hydro-zones. Our ordinance says it must be native, near developed areas people want to do ornamental so we say non-native, non-invasive in those particular areas, but it all has to meet the water budget. So any landscape plan is subject to MELO and would all have to be native.

Applicant Team (Steve Welton) – When the water was done, looked at what the actual allocation was from Ojai Valley Water District, and that was an acre-foot, and looked at our actual usage over since then, have been averaging well below the actual allocation.

Member Malloy - You mentioned water offset measures

Planning Staff – typically see plumbing fixtures that are water-efficient, rainwater collection.

Applicant Team (Rabbi Joe) - Ramah maintains a 2.5 million gallon open reservoir that is dually fed from Casitas water and a well that we dug, it's used for a little bit of irrigation on the camp but primarily is used for fire mitigation. It was used extensively by helicopters in the Thomas Fire.

Member Malloy – There was mention of temporary speakers in areas where sound is a concern – has there been any training on where to place and point speakers? CUP is very specific and that sounds hard to implement – could these be more permanent speakers or slots?

Applicant Team (Rabbi Joe) – spaces with speakers are the sports courts, amphitheater and off the dining hall, these speakers have the sound attenuating system attached to them. However, in working with kids, it will also be a supervision challenge that we will continue to work on.

Member Malloy – As part of having suggestions about this CUP, we are also recommending the legalization of structures and the sports courts. Have you reviewed if they are all now up to code, because that information was not included in this packet.

Planning Staff – My understanding is that these structures that will be brought into the scope of the permit, any illegally constructed building that requires a permit, would be required to go through the process, legalized and brought up to code.

Applicant Team (Steve Welton) – There are few structures not permitted, an outdoor sports court, a restroom that has a meditation deck with a shade structure and other minor structures. Not talking about cabins or living spaces.

Member Malloy- just want to make sure we understand what we are doing.

Planning Staff – for clarification the sports court that needs the sound attenuation, will that need the sound blankets or the tennis courts?

Applicant Team (Rabbi Joe) – No it's the tennis courts adjacent to it.

Chair Cohen – Question about daily visitors, in the reports there are figures of about 900 and then a figure of 1800? Are those the maximum cap or is that the level you have now? They seem high.

Applicant Team (Steve Welton) – Referring to the project description, we used the maximum density we had based on the acreage to show the total amount of campers that would be allowed based on that density depending on the type of zone you have. Just calculated what you could have theoretically given the acreage. With existing acreage, the maximum overnight campers are

855 and the maximum day use is 1709 of the ordinance for the existing parcels now.

Chair Cohen - Is that level anticipated or are you experiencing that level of use now?

Applicant Team (Steve Welton) – The rabbi can speak to it, but it varies throughout the year depending on what's happening.

Applicant Team (Rabbi Joe) – We have had a visitors' day which historically has been a difficult day for our neighbors. So we have changed their parking to Nordhoff High School, and bus people in from there to help ameliorate traffic concerns. That's the only day we might have 1,000 visitors or something like that.

Member Malloy – Just to confirm, this CUP establishes what numbers exactly for campers, staff? 665? Good to have in mind as we move to talk about having an official limit on the number campers, as you are voluntarily accepting these numbers.

Planning Staff - 2 two-week sessions available for campers during the summer months camp Ramah hosts 600- 650 campers over each four-week session. Camp Ramah summer sessions include 93-day time and 255 overnight employees, and 6 residents who live on site. One family visitation day, per camp session, only during the day, and the camp outdoor programs occur 7:45 am – 9 pm, Sunday through Friday, and on 7:45 am and 10 pm on Saturdays. For NON summer programs and activities, camp Ramah hosts approx. 90 programs and activities per year for adult and youth campers. During non-summer months, camp Ramah is staffed by 37 daytime employees and 2 residents who live onsite. The non-summer months activities generally occur Monday through Sunday 8 am to 10 pm (see attachment 5 of the MND for the snapshots of the year 2019).

Chair Cohen – Does the CUP require the number of attendees doesn't go over those or does it allow for these 900 & 1800 figures?

Planning Staff – the project description is based on what their estimated enrollment is. That is what is being analyzed.

Member Malloy – So if they go over, the CUP is null?

Planning Staff – No, they would have to modify. So we would know that they have the accommodation for it but any other potential impact issue area is analyzed.

Member Malloy – Is the term typically 20 years for a camp this size? Could be it 10 years?

Planning Staff - it's ordinarily up to the decision-maker as to the term of the permit. Ordinarily, we see 10-year permits, but because it's very expensive to do this we are entertaining longer terms but it is a use permit and if they aren't good servants of their permit it could jeopardize their CUP and it could go before the decision-makers if in violation.

Member Kennedy – do we have any records of what violations have occurred with the current CUP?

Planning Staff - Not personally, but we do have a division that does take complaints, would need to defer to our condition's compliance division to any Compliance complaints have been received. We are a complaint-based county, so planning staff cannot file the complaint, it would have to come from a neighbor or the general public.

Planning Staff (Dave Ward) - we do review CUPs on a three-year rolling basis, as our initiative to go back check-in with the operator and, check the conditions to make sure that they are operating as envisioned under the permit.

Member Malloy – If there were to be complaints would you address them on the 3-year cycle and not on the 20-year cycle?

Planning Staff – Complaints are investigated when they are received. Would not wait for the third year.

Applicant Team (Steve Welton) - Wanted to clarify that you understand how the proposed Sound Attenuation will work - it will be used in conjunction with our sound engineer who will measure sound levels at the property boundary. The sound monitoring systems compare that to the county's noise ordinance what is allowed at certain times of the day, measure that on the system at a certain level, figure out what the voltage is for that to be in compliance, and set that as the maximum that the speaker system can operate on. So you physical cannot exceed the sound level threshold.

Chair Cohen opened up the item for Public Comment.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Jane Carroll: Signed up for public comment because even though I have worked with Camp Ramah (CR) since 1992. Also had a relationship with KFA; but I'm speaking as a resident and parent of the Ojai Valley. Interesting that both are on tonight; one of the attractions of being here, is the ethical and spiritual education from many organizations, for both children and adults. Understand that there are concerns with traffic, noise, lights, sound, and those definitely need to be mitigated, for the neighbors, but know not alone in valuing what these organizations have brought over the years to this area.

Christine White: located at 1417 Foothill Rd – but the sound carries up the hill and it's very loud in the evenings till late.... But sound may not be spreading at the monitors but the sound goes up, and it does impact us. Sitting on our back patio and can hear music loud, Fleetwood Mac, it's like a rock concert and that's from the amplified music system. When I think of a camp, I think of just singing and guitar playing acoustic, not amplified music system until 10 pm. In the past, the hours get pushed out a bit as kids love the music and love to dance, but its too loud for the neighbors. I don't think 300 feet is not enough for the public notice, needs to be a larger radius of ½ mile. The 24-hour phone number is not really enforceable, doesn't always have an answer, and then say that we are allowed to make noise; there should be a line to the County that the County can go and explain; Feels the CUP goes into a drawer and there needs to be a better system of tracking. Not really enforced, no way to really check up on things, needs to be a better complaint tracking system. Perhaps on the internet so there can follow up by the county and people can track in real time. 90 events, are the events defined as one day or can they be weeklong events? Need clarification on how many days those events really are.

Ramona Schroder: In the spirit of the debate, going to give the counterpoint; Fairview is a small country road, only about 32 feet wide. Have heard that it might have to get widened, are we all going to have to pay for that? Brought seven letters from the neighbors closets to the camp entrance, sent to the OVMAC, all of whom say to absolutely deny CUP full stop; it's very serious; we've been doing this for decades; the house I live in is right across the street. My family has been there before Camp Ramah, they razed an orchid farm to build the camp. Fairview neighbors could walk down what is now Camp Ramah Road, all the way to the foothill trail, not anymore, there is a guard gate. How did that happen? What happened to that road? Did it go from public to

private to guard gate? Mark my words this will happen with the Cozy Dell and the other trail. Someone will put a rouse out there and there will be a guard gate. We will have to deal with this for years to come. The camp hasn't been a good neighbor, the noise vibrations, traffic, and light pollution is unbearable. There have been incidents of trespass and vandalism, we've had to put up \$22,000 worth of fencing, gates and surveillance. To whom do I send the bill? The County of Ventura supports and rubber stamps whatever camp Ramah requests. While neighbors bare the brunt while the camp rakes in the income, possibly tax free. Bed tax? They have a 55-room hotel. How is this helping our magical valley? Please make sure there are 7 letters that are received and put in the permanent file.

Tim and Nona Reed: I am a neighbor and I have a different view. I live at 321 Fairview Rd. at the top of Fairview Road and next to the reservoir and meditation deck. Camp Ramah was so kind, they let me have my son's wedding on the deck, allowed my guest to park at the camp, using their guard services. They have been nothing but a good neighbor to me for 35 years. I mean no disrespect to my neighbors and I want to be clear on the topography of my home, I have a mountain between me and Camp Ramah and I have no noise complaints. I'm the lucky one, I appreciate what they are saying. When the fire came, there was a buffer, and the helicopters were dipping into their (Camp Ramah's) reservoir dumping water into our neighborhood. There are some real positive things Camp Ramah does, I appreciate their complaints and if it was me, I would have a different opinion. I have had nothing but good experiences with the camp.

Nona: I've been a neighbor for 58 years - back entrance to Camp Ramah, have had a great relationship with the Camp. Now I live at a different residence, any time there's been any issues they've always been so nice. I really believe when they did all the fire prevention, it saved our home, it saved our loved ones, and our neighborhood. They do a huge firebreak around the whole property. They have been great neighbors.

Diane Bertoy: Live on Foothill Road and looked at the water use, I read almost all of the 598 pages of the MND, 15-18 and 227; one section I wrote they are going to increase water allocation by 5.5 acre-foot per year and casitas may have to level a conservative penalty. County has a way of giving a number of people allowed per acre, but now they can have much more if the County planning lets them. It happened in the 70's the camp got bigger and noisier, more electric equipment. Rabbi and Michael are wonderful, they do listen, but I don't think they are able to monitor the young adults and older teens that want to party at night. I can still hear them in my bedroom with the windows closed with earplugs. Spoke to letter in 1988 issued by the County. I don't think they can monitor them, it's a big area. When they take down the protected oaks I will have access to my side of the property; and am giving you this letter. Wish they would be quiet at least by 9 pm.

Jerry Maryniuk: Diane's husband - we moved to Ojai to be to Paradise; the noise is such a big problem, and have tried to get out of Ojai for the Summer to avoid the noise. The noise really does go straight uphill to us. I want to thank Rabbi Joe and Randy Michaels for all their efforts to truly be good neighbors. I fully support the camp, but I don't support the noise. I'm worried about 40 years of complaints and supposed remediations and fixing problems, the same problems still exist. I am not confident that these remediations will take care of the problem. I think its foolish to consider a 20 years CUP based on remediations that no one knows if they are going to make a difference. We could use as a guiding principle the Ventura County Noise Ordinance which prohibits noise in a residential zone during the times of 9 pm and 7 am at a distance of 50 feet from the property line. Also worried by bullhorns they are loud and obnoxious. The sounds studies measure an average noise level over an hour, a bullhorn and people screaming, may only be there for a few minutes but the noise peaks are what wake you at night. I ask that you recommend to the Board of Supervisors to approve a temporary more limited CUP and reassess in a year and then decide if more changes are needed.

Julie Grist: Live on 1477 Foothill less than a mile from Camp Ramah; it is noisy, it's open space, it bounces and the idea of sound blankets around a court is ridiculous because the sound goes up and they play a lot of teen music. Just want to say it should never be 20 years for the CUP because we've been fighting and having problems all along. The mitigation efforts have not worked at all, we do call Rabbi Joe and faculty and say "ok we'll take care of it" but they are not onsite. The idea of putting a limit on the speakers is great, but even if they are pointed in a certain way, someone is going to hear it. I think they need to limit the number of outside guests, 90 events, that's 2-times per week. We hear the parties and weddings, people want to have fun, but shouldn't go to 10 pm. You can't sit outside and look at the moon for a few minutes without feeling interrupted, it really affects our quiet Ojai Valley. I would like to suggest, instead of building new dorms, why don't they build a big interior gym and they can have all their events inside. The CUP should have a well-designed landscaping plan; they are removing oaks, and I don't think it should include the additional parcels which would make it even more campers.

Scott Supan: Live at 547, a few driveways from the camp, lived here for 30 years. I've had the pleasure of hearing the children have a wonderful time, it's what kids should be doing. Tim lives on the other side of the mountain; he's insulated from the noise. McDonald drain which is Fairview Rd. it's a box canyon, one way in and one way out. There's a creek and nesting turtles, western pond turtles and the location of the Camp is in the Valley. I have NO complaints; other than in the evenings, the noise has nowhere to go – it goes straight up the back, or it goes straight down the valley. It's a box canyon. You guys want to have fun, I totally appreciate that, the neighbors want to have peace and quiet; it's not a plains area, whatever happens there, transmits straight down the valley or up out of the valley. Sound mitigation is a wonderful idea, but it's hard to maintain, it's hard to secure it to make it non-fallible. But the last couple of years have gotten louder than ever before. We love hearing the kids, but we need to mitigate the noise. Don't believe it would be in the best interest of the Valley to were to expand on that, because things creep, you set up something a certain way and then things get bigger. Would caution against expanding CUP. There is no easy way out, the only way is to make less noise.

Scott Lundy: local contractor, wants to say something in favor of the camp; they contracted me to replace all exterior lights with dark sky compliant lights. I told them it's an Ojai City ordinance, but they wanted to do it even when it wasn't required. They spent a lot of money on their oak tree maintenance, there is no way they are going to cut them, they love their trees.

Elaine Aliberti: I live about a mile (from the camp), many of my neighbors were not notified of the proposed major expansion, just found out about the proposed CUP a couple of days ago. When they are in full operation can hear them loud and clear. This is not a little boom-box situation, this is you better like their choice of music because it's in your living room day or night, every night of the week when they are fully operational in the summer. I cannot sit outside and enjoy my music, I have to listen to theirs. They are proposing to build 15k sq. ft. of new structures, but none of these structures are going to address our problems of noise. They could build a gym and have all their activities, café Ezra and all amplified music in there, like most schools, but instead they want to impose upon us. These mitigation measures are easily reversible. Sound blankets can be lifted up, sound speakers can be turned around and volume turned up, etc., kids are tech-savvy. By their own admission tonight, they know there have been these problems for a while, they know they need to do mitigation measures, they've stated they hope to get CUP and then do mitigation measures. They know they are disturbing us, by allowing them the CUP you are asking the coyote to guard the hen house. This is not working, they are only going to do these mitigations when they are down to the wire, and then let the teenagers pull the plug. This isn't fair to us, we have been complaining for this for decades, we have complaints filed back in the 80's. They make recommendations, there should be a contact number, but it hasn't been handled. They know they need to mitigate the sound, why haven't you done it yet? NO to any major expansion

of the of the CUP, no to the CUP at all, make them abide by the law, the Ventura County ordinances, the California State criminal law for public nuisance and public disturbance, this isn't fair to the neighborhood.

Applicant Team Response to Public Comments:

Rabbi Joe: Would like to clarify a few things, in regard to trees, we've had several near misses of tree branches or trees that have fallen, within seconds or feet of children or young adults being killed. As a non-profit we've spent an unimaginable amount of money for tree mitigation, studies and planting of new trees. We applied for a tree-planting grant with the county. The Mahon village less than half the space is for dorms, and over half will be multi-purpose programming space. It is an indoor programming space. Our only sizeable indoor space is our dining hall. This will provide a meaningful indoor space. There have been great strides since I've been here in 2011, there is a significant difference in terms of late-night music and yelling, would hope there is at least some recognition of the trajectory of the relationship we are trying to build.

Randy: in regard to the comment about the increased level of noise in the last few years, the fires did actually impact that, the lessened some of the dampening around, that created some of that noise that's continuing. The trajectory is there, but we've had some things that have impacted our ability to put some of those mitigations in place, just wanted to make that point.

Steve Welton: In regard to the 90 events, that is based on a 2019 baseline, of events that occurred in 2019. So that's why it that was mentioned in the MND, we are not proposing 90 new events. The county used the baseline to make determination. Those are events could have several days, some can be over weekend and some just during the daytime.

Member Wright: Is 90 events what you are approved for by permits or what you've done historically.

Steve Welton: There is currently no limit, the county was trying to determine that, the camp provided their roster of all their event attendees and cars. In terms of density from the existing acreage the additional parcels, open space. Yes, it does potentially increase the threshold, but the actual amount is very low, it would only be like 80 more if they use the land use density. The benefit of adding the open space acreage is minimal in terms of additional campers allowed under county ordinance for a maximum allowed overnight or during the day. It's a very small number or people per acreage.

Lisa _____: Land Use Counsel for Camp Ramah - want to clarify what is current and what is proposed; the existing permit does not have any real book ends or thresholds; through this process, this has taken 5 years; we are looking at including these measures and thresholds are part of this. There's no ability for the kids to take over and up the volume. The kids are not allowed to have cell phones or ability to connect with the system; the system is closed and it's set up in a way that no one can affect it. If the CUP is not approved, then you are left with the status-quo. The six trees that were going to removed were destroyed with the fire. No other trees will be removed. Through the approval of this CUP modification, there will be improvements that will be monitorable that the camp is accountable for because they are specifically written in mitigation measures. The county can have violation hearings based on the CUP that is on file, which it does not currently have the ability to do. Currently no mitigation measures related to noise in there, once they are in there you can enforce them, in that way that nothing is right now. What's on the table now is modifying the existing CUP with no expiration date, not to shut down the camp, not what we are talking about. We are trying to figure out a way to make things better at the camp that gives you more control and more push points that you can reach out to the county if there is an issue and having an expiration where they would need to go back and get it renewed, because

it doesn't exist right now, if they don't have that, they can just operate forever. The CUP is not expired, this is not a renewal, this is a modification to a CUP that exists and could exist for eternity. Instead of allowing that to happen the camp is volunteering conditions, it's volunteering set limits on the number of campers, this is the opportunity to create an umbrella under which the camp can operate. That is what the camp is agreeing to, to numbers, to mitigation measures, and to a time they have to come back and get it renewed in 20 years.

Member Wright: Want to discuss the Sound Study, get clarification on the numbers taken at 3 locations. Were the locations selected because they were the worst?

Planning Staff: There were 3 off-site residences that agreed to have noise measured at their property. Unsure if they were the worst, but they volunteered.

Member Wright:: 99% of the time all 3 were within the legal limit. What would be the difference in the future? It sounds like this would only get better if these mitigations were in place. Would the applicant be willing to go below the limit on a regular basis so it won't exceeded in the future? Is that a possibility?

Applicant team: Noise analysis didn't have the noise mitigations, so the idea is when you add the mitigations measures would be significantly lower than what it already is right now which already doesn't violate the noise standards.

Member Wright:: Can we go below the limit to appease the neighbors?

Applicant team: As its going to be designed right now, its simplest to design to the 10 pm timeframe at 50 dba, whereas we could be at 55 dba during the day. 1 setting for all day, which is the most limited setting, so yes in a way we are already below of what's proposed. Would not violate the 45 dba that kicks in at 10 pm, we would have no sounds at 10 pm. The only sound would be café Ezra which will comply. So the dba thresholds are 6 am – 7 pm is 55 dba, 7 – 10 pm is 50 dba, 10 pm – 6 am is 45 dba.

Member Kennedy: asked about the County Ordinance stating there is a 9 pm notice
Applicant team: Louder or raucous noise policy is different than the noise ordinance. There are multiple ordinances, there's sustained noise and then loud short-term blasts. The technical report included all noise ordinances as part of the analysis.

Chair Cohen: why is there a 10 pm cut off and not a 9 pm for amplified sound?

Member Malloy: How would camp staff feel about a 9 pm no amplified music, would that be a problem?

Rabbi Joe: That would be difficult, my staff already hates me because of what I've done in the past years in terms of stopping when we do. For older kids I think volume direction needs to be managed appropriately, 9 pm hard across the board would be difficult to do that.

Member Malloy: You all do so much other great stuff other than amplified music after 9 pm. How important is amplified sound after 9 pm to the culture of the camp? Is it something that could be shifted inside?

Applicant team: Can't be shifted inside, we are talking about different age groups, would love the idea of creating a big multi-purpose building that could house the whole camp, but not in the cards for various reasons. The older kids finish dinner and have an evening program, not a loud dance party, but something that includes music and 9 pm sounds uncomfortably early.

Applicant team: Camp observes Sabbath, so no amplified sounds on Friday, Saturday you can't start any amplified sound until it's dark out, around 8:45 pm so they only have about an hour where they can have amplified sound which is the end of Sabbath celebration. The possibility of weekend amplified sound is very limited. We've been excellent about stopping on time at 10 pm.

9:04 PM Closing public comment closed; deliberations:

Chair Cohen: Want to confirm that the easement for the trail couldn't happen the way it was envisioned, did not see anything about a mitigation measure for making sure access is continued. Would love for that to be formalized to ensure that there is continued public access.

Applicant team: we have no problem with it. Your previous recommendations included that and we are ready to accept that.

Planning Staff: This is an environmental document that has mitigation measures in it. At the staff report stage we can apply conditions of approval. There aren't any recorded easements, however, there is such a thing as prescriptive easement which means they are constantly being used, so would never be taken from the public.

Chair Cohen: Would like to see more details about landscaping, greywater, rainwater.

Member Wright – Want final confirmation that the sound will be limited to 50 dba? Will the monitors used during the study be out there at the residences?

Applicant team: The Sound engineer proposes to monitor property boundaries and set electric values so that it won't exceeded. Set along with the sound blankets and other measures as set the CUP.

Member Malloy: Would it be possible to have a condition that the sound surveys are done at the exact same locations and put in the exact same place after the mitigations are all in place and during a typical summer camp? Would the applicant be comfortable doing that?

Rabbi Joe: Sure.

Planning Staff: If the residents agree

Rabbi Joe: we do not use megaphones, we only have them for emergencies. No megaphones used throughout the summer or used to speak to a group. I recognize that the alarm that go on those can be very jarring, that's something that we used periodically, but now is something we have absolutely eliminated. We use a microphone with speakers set up, being one of the 3 locations with permitted speakers with limits. We have two emergency poles that have alarms and are tested and we have emergency drills at beginning of 4 week sessions, with prerecorded messages for emergency situations.

Member Malloy – the sound blankets to be put up sounded like they were going to be up and down with sports, possible to leave them up?

Applicant team: Wouldn't be practical for us to move them, the recommendation was to have them at 8 feet, the neighbors wanted 10 feet, so we moved them to 10 feet, it's just not practical so we were intending to take it down.

Member Malloy: could we change them it permanently?

Rabbi Joe: from a supervision of children perspective there is concern with security and views of the children. Make sure they are okay. I don't like the entire southern and eastern portion of our tennis courts blocked off. If the technology exists that could go up and down yes, but not permanent because of safety concerns.

Chair Cohen - the restriction on the PA system sounds like a good idea, and want to make sure there is something that works because it hasn't been implemented yet a that it actually fixes the noise problem that has been going on for a long time. I know you are offering these things voluntarily in exchange for the ability to build this additional structure.

Member Kennedy: I feel that that the County Planning Division will be on it, if someone has a complaint, they're going to be dealing with it right away and they are going to know if they are within their means. I can attest that the county of Ventura planning will be monitoring this very closely.

Audience member: I had it monitored on mine (property) and would be happy to offer it again.

Member Malloy: It sounds like the new space is really for the older teens, I imagine it's them and the counselors that like their music loud late, I would imagine that they'd be open to moving things indoors. Is that something you could work into your handbook, maybe encourage them.

Chair Cohen - Would recommend approval provided that the Cozy Dell easement is more formalized, as long as the landscaping and greywater plans are more formalized, and as long as there is a follow up monitoring put in place for the automatic noise reduction program that involves willing neighbors for additional sound analysis after implementing the noise mitigations; that staff looks into 9 pm instead of 10 pm, and to remove the tree removal part, with all other comments remaining from the Meeting Minutes of Dec. 2019 with the exception of the Café Ezra; once Mahon is constructed, move Café Ezra activities into said space or other indoor space.

Moved: Chair Cohen

Seconded: Member Malloy

Upon call of the roll the vote was as follows:

Ayes: **Member Wright, Member Malloy, Member Kennedy, Chair Cohen**

Noes: None

Absent:

Motion Carries: 4-0

Let the record show that after the OVMAC 5/16 meeting, staff and the applicant team confirmed that four trees are going to be removed. These are not located on the Open Space Parcel and are not Heritage Trees. The loss will be mitigated in accordance with County policies.

9. Review of a Modification to Conditional Use Permit application for Krishnamurti Camp (Case No. PL17-0012)

Motion to continue this Item No. 9 to Special Meeting to the Oak View Parks and Rec Center. 5/25 at 7pm.

Moved: Chair Cohen

Seconded: Member Malloy

Upon call of the roll the vote was as follows:

Ayes: **Member Wright, Member Malloy, Member Kennedy, Chair Cohen**

Noes: None

Absent:

Motion Carries: 4-0

10. Announcements and Updates

- a. County Planning Ojai Valley Traffic Policy Presentation – June 20, 2022
- b. CHP Public Information Officer Presentation – July 18, 2022
- c. Hwy 33 Intermodal Study – Cal Trans Update – Fall 2022
- d. Congressman Carbajal Meet-n-Greet – Still TBD
- e. Potential Video Recording of OVMAC Meetings

11. Councilmember Comments

Letter of Support for the Grazing Option and Fire Safe Council. Will be sending a letter via email for confirmation to the MAC and then sending it to Chris for the grant application. Moved by **Chair Cohen**, Seconded by **Member Kennedy**. Unanimously approved.

12. Meeting Adjourned at 9:33 PM.

The next REGULAR meeting will be held on **Monday, June 20th at 7:00 PM IN PERSON at the Oak View Community Center.**

**The Krishnamurti Item will be heard at a SPECIAL meeting at the Oak View Parks and Recreation Center at 555 Mahoney Avenue on May 25, 2022.

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION, and for persons who require accommodation for any audio, visual or other disability in order to review an agenda, or to participate in a meeting of the Municipal Advisory Council per the American Disabilities Act (ADA), may obtain information or assistance by Supervisor Matt LaVere's Office at 805-654-2703 or e-mail ovmac@ventura.org. Any such request for disability accommodation must be received at least 48 hours prior to the scheduled meeting for which assistance is requested. Additional Ojai Valley MAC information is available online at: <https://www.ventura.org/board-of-supervisors/district-1/ovmac/>